Ohio Department of Transportation
Official Bid Tabulation
Jack Marchbanks, Ph.D., Director

Project No. 220570
PID 111489
CUY-Independence Blvd Bridge
Federal
Type: BRIDGE REPLACEMENT (1 BRIDGE)
Letting Date: 11/3/2022
Completion Date: 8/4/2023

Contract Awarded To: BLACK HORSE BRIDGE CONSTRUCTION INC
Award Amount: $909,360.10

Engineer's Estimate: $927,000.00

Bidder 1
BLACK HORSE BRIDGE CONSTRUCTION INC
5185 WOOSTER ROAD WEST
Summit
NORTON, OH 44203
Bid $909,360.10

Bidder 2
J D WILLIAMSON CONSTRUCTION CO INC
441 GENEVA AVE, PO BOX 113
Summit
TALLMADGE, OH 44278
Bid $946,575.15

Bidder 3
SCHIRMER CONSTRUCTION LLC
31350 INDUSTRIAL PARKWAY
Cuyahoga
NORTH OLMSTED, OH 44070
Bid $1,017,462.50

Bidder 4
MARUCCI & GAFFNEY EXCAVATING CO
18 HOGUE ST
Mahoning
YOUNGSTOWN, OH 44502
Bid $1,024,040.85

Bidder 5
KENMORE CONSTRUCTION CO INC
700 HOME AVE
Summit
AKRON, OH 44310
Bid $1,061,765.25

Ref #1	**201E11000**	**CLEARING AND GRUBBING, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$12,000.00	$12,000.00
	2	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	3	$4,000.00	$4,000.00
	4	$20,000.00	$20,000.00
	5	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
Ref #2	**202E23000**	**PAVEMENT REMOVED, (157 SY)**	
	Awd	$38.00	$5,966.00
	2	$39.00	$6,123.00
	3	$30.00	$4,710.00
	4	$15.00	$2,355.00
	5	$20.00	$3,140.00
Ref #3	**202E30000**	**WALK REMOVED, (1076 SF)**	
	Awd	$2.00	$2,152.00
	2	$2.70	$2,905.20
	3	$3.00	$3,228.00
	4	$3.00	$3,228.00
	5	$3.00	$3,228.00
Ref #4	**202E32000**	**CURB REMOVED, (212 FT)**	
	Awd	$6.00	$1,272.00
	2	$4.40	$932.80
	3	$12.00	$2,544.00
	4	$5.00	$1,060.00
	5	$3.00	$636.00
Ref #5	**202E75000**	**FENCE REMOVED, (64 FT)**	
	Awd	$12.00	$768.00
	2	$6.00	$384.00
	3	$10.00	$640.00
	4	$15.00	$960.00
	5	$10.00	$640.00
Ref #6	**203E10000**	**EXCAVATION, (120 CY)**	
	Awd	$45.00	$5,400.00
	2	$35.00	$4,200.00
	3	$40.00	$4,800.00
	4	$25.00	$3,000.00
	5	$50.00	$6,000.00
Ref #7	**203E20000**	**EMBANKMENT, (6 CY)**	
	Awd	$45.00	$270.00
	2	$105.00	$630.00
	3	$175.00	$1,050.00
	4	$100.00	$600.00
	5	$100.00	$600.00
Ref #8	**204E10000**	**SUBGRADE COMPACTION, (359 SY)**	
	Awd	$5.00	$1,795.00
	2	$6.00	$2,154.00
	3	$4.00	$1,436.00
	4	$6.00	$2,154.00
	5	$3.00	$1,077.00

Ref #9	**607E23000**	**FENCE, TYPE CLT, (42 FT)**	
	Awd	$85.50	$3,591.00
	2	$90.00	$3,780.00
	3	$165.00	$6,930.00
	4	$155.00	$6,510.00
	5	$150.00	$6,300.00
Ref #10	**608E10001**	**4" CONCRETE WALK, AS PER PLAN, (631 SF)**	
	Awd	$15.00	$9,465.00
	2	$13.50	$8,518.50
	3	$14.00	$8,834.00
	4	$20.00	$12,620.00
	5	$10.00	$6,310.00
Ref #11	**609E26000**	**CURB, TYPE 6, (110 FT)**	
	Awd	$67.00	$7,370.00
	2	$55.00	$6,050.00
	3	$85.00	$9,350.00
	4	$40.00	$4,400.00
	5	$40.00	$4,400.00
Ref #12	**625E32000**	**GROUND ROD, (4 EACH)**	
	Awd	$345.00	$1,380.00
	2	$365.00	$1,460.00
	3	$250.00	$1,000.00
	4	$250.00	$1,000.00
	5	$350.00	$1,400.00

Section 1 - ROADWAY - Totals

Awd	**$51,429.00**
2	**$47,137.50**
3	**$48,522.00**
4	**$57,887.00**
5	**$43,731.00**

Ref #13	**659E00100**	**SOIL ANALYSIS TEST, (2 EACH)**	
	Awd	$100.00	$200.00
	2	$158.00	$316.00
	3	$25.00	$50.00
	4	$20.00	$40.00
	5	$200.00	$400.00
Ref #14	**659E00300**	**TOPSOIL, (19 CY)**	
	Awd	$90.00	$1,710.00
	2	$40.00	$760.00
	3	$125.00	$2,375.00
	4	$75.00	$1,425.00
	5	$40.00	$760.00
Ref #15	**659E00500**	**SEEDING AND MULCHING, CLASS 1, (171 SY)**	
	Awd	$7.00	$1,197.00
	2	$5.00	$855.00
	3	$10.00	$1,710.00
	4	$15.00	$2,565.00
	5	$19.50	$3,334.50

Ref #16	**659E14000**	**REPAIR SEEDING AND MULCHING, (9 SY)**	
	Awd	$10.00	$90.00
	2	$1.50	$13.50
	3	$5.00	$45.00
	4	$1.00	$9.00
	5	$2.00	$18.00
Ref #17	**659E15000**	**INTER-SEEDING, (9 SY)**	
	Awd	$10.00	$90.00
	2	$0.20	$1.80
	3	$5.00	$45.00
	4	$1.00	$9.00
	5	$1.00	$9.00
Ref #18	**659E20000**	**COMMERCIAL FERTILIZER, (0.02 TON)**	
	Awd	$500.00	$10.00
	2	$1,600.00	$32.00
	3	$100.00	$2.00
	4	$500.00	$10.00
	5	$1,600.00	$32.00
Ref #19	**659E31000**	**LIME, (0.04 ACRE)**	
	Awd	$200.00	$8.00
	2	$95.00	$3.80
	3	$100.00	$4.00
	4	$50.00	$2.00
	5	$90.00	$3.60
Ref #20	**659E35000**	**WATER, (0.95 MGAL)**	
	Awd	$1.05	$1.00
	2	$1.00	$0.95
	3	$50.00	$47.50
	4	$1.00	$0.95
	5	$10.00	$9.50
Ref #21	**832E30000**	**EROSION CONTROL, (5000 EACH)**	
	Awd	$1.00	$5,000.00
	2	$1.00	$5,000.00
	3	$1.00	$5,000.00
	4	$1.00	$5,000.00
	5	$1.00	$5,000.00

Section 2 - EROSION CONTROL - Totals

Awd	**$8,306.00**
2	**$6,983.05**
3	**$9,278.50**
4	**$9,060.95**
5	**$9,566.60**

Ref #22	**605E14020**	**6" BASE PIPE UNDERDRAINS WITH GEOTEXTILE FABRIC, (96 FT)**	
	Awd	$40.00	$3,840.00
	2	$28.00	$2,688.00
	3	$35.00	$3,360.00
	4	$20.00	$1,920.00
	5	$20.00	$1,920.00

Ref #23	**611E98630**	**CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (2 EACH)**	
	Awd	$1,750.00	$3,500.00
	2	$775.00	$1,550.00
	3	$500.00	$1,000.00
	4	$750.00	$1,500.00
	5	$400.00	$800.00
Ref #24	**611E99654**	**MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (2 EACH)**	
	Awd	$1,750.00	$3,500.00
	2	$765.00	$1,530.00
	3	$900.00	$1,800.00
	4	$1,350.00	$2,700.00
	5	$500.00	$1,000.00

Section 3 - DRAINAGE - Totals

Awd	**$10,840.00**
2	**$5,768.00**
3	**$6,160.00**
4	**$6,120.00**
5	**$3,720.00**

Ref #25	**301E56000**	**ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE, PG64-22, (449), (43 CY)**	
	Awd	$335.00	$14,405.00
	2	$352.00	$15,136.00
	3	$360.00	$15,480.00
	4	$335.00	$14,405.00
	5	$350.00	$15,050.00
Ref #26	**304E20001**	**AGGREGATE BASE, AS PER PLAN, (60 CY)**	
	Awd	$96.00	$5,760.00
	2	$95.00	$5,700.00
	3	$125.00	$7,500.00
	4	$110.00	$6,600.00
	5	$70.00	$4,200.00
Ref #27	**407E10000**	**TACK COAT, (21 GAL)**	
	Awd	$4.00	$84.00
	2	$4.00	$84.00
	3	$5.00	$105.00
	4	$4.00	$84.00
	5	$5.00	$105.00
Ref #28	**441E50101**	**ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), AS, (14 CY)**	
	Awd	$515.00	$7,210.00
	2	$540.00	$7,560.00
	3	$600.00	$8,400.00
	4	$515.00	$7,210.00
	5	$530.00	$7,420.00

Section 4 - PAVEMENT - Totals

Awd	**$27,459.00**
2	**$28,480.00**
3	**$31,485.00**
4	**$28,299.00**
5	**$26,775.00**

Ref #29	**638E10800**	**VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE, (1 EACH)**	
	Awd	$1,500.00	$1,500.00
	2	$305.00	$305.00
	3	$250.00	$250.00
	4	$100.00	$100.00
	5	$450.00	$450.00

Section 5 - WATER WORK - Totals

Awd	**$1,500.00**
2	**$305.00**
3	**$250.00**
4	**$100.00**
5	**$450.00**

Ref #30	**630E84900**	**REMOVAL OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGN AND DISPOSAL, (4 EACH)**	
	Awd	$90.00	$360.00
	2	$32.00	$128.00
	3	$100.00	$400.00
	4	$89.40	$357.60
	5	$90.00	$360.00
Ref #31	**630E85200**	**REMOVAL OF GROUND MOUNTED SIGN AND DELIVERY, (1 EACH)**	
	Awd	$80.00	$80.00
	2	$53.00	$53.00
	3	$90.00	$90.00
	4	$79.50	$79.50
	5	$80.00	$80.00
Ref #32	**630E86002**	**REMOVAL OF GROUND MOUNTED POST SUPPORT AND DISPOSA, (4 EACH)**	
	Awd	$90.00	$360.00
	2	$53.00	$212.00
	3	$100.00	$400.00
	4	$89.40	$357.60
	5	$90.00	$360.00
Ref #33	**630E86050**	**REMOVAL OF GROUND MOUNTED POST SUPPORT AND DELIVER, (1 EACH)**	
	Awd	$80.00	$80.00
	2	$79.00	$79.00
	3	$90.00	$90.00
	4	$79.50	$79.50
	5	$80.00	$80.00
Ref #34	**642E00300**	**CENTER LINE, TYPE 1, (0.03 MILE)**	
	Awd	$69,000.00	$2,070.00
	2	$60,500.00	$1,815.00
	3	$75,000.00	$2,250.00
	4	$68,930.00	$2,067.90
	5	$68,930.00	$2,067.90

Section 6 - TRAFFIC CONTROL - Totals

Awd	**$2,950.00**
2	**$2,287.00**
3	**$3,230.00**
4	**$2,942.10**
5	**$2,947.90**

Ref #35	**614E11110**	**LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICER WITH PATROL CAR FOR ASSIST, (24 HOUR)**	
	Awd	$80.00	$1,920.00
	2	$68.00	$1,632.00
	3	$55.00	$1,320.00
	4	$60.00	$1,440.00
	5	$85.00	$2,040.00
Ref #36	**614E12420**	**DETOUR SIGNING, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$6,000.00	$6,000.00
	2	$4,330.00	$4,330.00
	3	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
	4	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	5	$5,000.00	$5,000.00

Section 7 - MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC - Totals

Awd	**$7,920.00**
2	**$5,962.00**
3	**$6,320.00**
4	**$11,440.00**
5	**$7,040.00**

Ref #37	**202E11203**	**PORTIONS OF STRUCTURE REMOVED, OVER 20 FOOT SPAN, , (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$81,000.00	$81,000.00
	2	$123,000.00	$123,000.00
	3	$115,000.00	$115,000.00
	4	$200,000.00	$200,000.00
	5	$60,000.00	$60,000.00
Ref #38	**202E22900**	**APPROACH SLAB REMOVED, (162 SY)**	
	Awd	$44.00	$7,128.00
	2	$80.00	$12,960.00
	3	$40.00	$6,480.00
	4	$50.00	$8,100.00
	5	$30.00	$4,860.00
Ref #39	**202E23500**	**WEARING COURSE REMOVED, (297 SY)**	
	Awd	$32.00	$9,504.00
	2	$25.50	$7,573.50
	3	$17.00	$5,049.00
	4	$2.00	$594.00
	5	$30.00	$8,910.00
Ref #40	**503E11100**	**COFFERDAMS AND EXCAVATION BRACING, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$8,750.00	$8,750.00
	2	$200.00	$200.00
	3	$7,000.00	$7,000.00
	4	$20,000.00	$20,000.00
	5	$20,000.00	$20,000.00
Ref #41	**503E21101**	**UNCLASSIFIED EXCAVATION, AS PER PLAN, (174 CY)**	
	Awd	$130.00	$22,620.00
	2	$200.00	$34,800.00
	3	$65.00	$11,310.00
	4	$100.00	$17,400.00
	5	$80.00	$13,920.00

Ref #42	**509E10000**	**EPOXY COATED STEEL REINFORCEMENT, (29806 LB)**	
	Awd	$1.85	$55,141.10
	2	$1.60	$47,689.60
	3	$2.00	$59,612.00
	4	$1.45	$43,218.70
	5	$1.75	$52,160.50
Ref #43	**511E31611**	**CLASS QC2 CONCRETE, SUPERSTRUCTURE, AS PER PLAN, (66 CY)**	
	Awd	$925.00	$61,050.00
	2	$775.00	$51,150.00
	3	$850.00	$56,100.00
	4	$1,000.00	$66,000.00
	5	$1,200.00	$79,200.00
Ref #44	**511E43511**	**CLASS QC1 CONCRETE, ABUTMENT INCLUDING FOOTING, AS, (84 CY)**	
	Awd	$700.00	$58,800.00
	2	$640.00	$53,760.00
	3	$1,350.00	$113,400.00
	4	$675.00	$56,700.00
	5	$970.00	$81,480.00
Ref #45	**511E51511**	**CLASS QC2 CONCRETE, SIDEWALK, AS PER PLAN, (43 CY)**	
	Awd	$425.00	$18,275.00
	2	$325.00	$13,975.00
	3	$600.00	$25,800.00
	4	$600.00	$25,800.00
	5	$625.00	$26,875.00
Ref #46	**512E10050**	**SEALING OF CONCRETE SURFACES (NON-EPOXY), (205 SY)**	
	Awd	$15.00	$3,075.00
	2	$5.70	$1,168.50
	3	$10.00	$2,050.00
	4	$20.00	$4,100.00
	5	$25.25	$5,176.25
Ref #47	**512E10100**	**SEALING OF CONCRETE SURFACES (EPOXY-URETHANE), (71 SY)**	
	Awd	$38.00	$2,698.00
	2	$30.00	$2,130.00
	3	$65.00	$4,615.00
	4	$50.00	$3,550.00
	5	$63.00	$4,473.00
Ref #48	**515E12050**	**PRESTRESSED CONCRETE COMPOSITE BOX BEAM BRIDGE MEM, (11 EACH)**	
	Awd	$15,600.00	$171,600.00
	2	$18,000.00	$198,000.00
	3	$17,500.00	$192,500.00
	4	$13,675.00	$150,425.00
	5	$20,000.00	$220,000.00
Ref #49	**516E13400**	**3/4" PREFORMED EXPANSION JOINT FILLER, (8 SF)**	
	Awd	$15.00	$120.00
	2	$25.00	$200.00
	3	$5.00	$40.00
	4	$20.00	$160.00
	5	$50.00	$400.00

Ref #50	**516E13600**	**1" PREFORMED EXPANSION JOINT FILLER, (31 SF)**	
	Awd	$15.00	$465.00
	2	$25.00	$775.00
	3	$6.00	$186.00
	4	$20.00	$620.00
	5	$50.00	$1,550.00
Ref #51	**516E14014**	**INTEGRAL ABUTMENT EXPANSION JOINT SEAL, (98 FT)**	
	Awd	$30.00	$2,940.00
	2	$30.00	$2,940.00
	3	$45.00	$4,410.00
	4	$40.00	$3,920.00
	5	$50.00	$4,900.00
Ref #52	**516E41100**	**1/8" PREFORMED BEARING PAD, (22 EACH)**	
	Awd	$30.00	$660.00
	2	$45.00	$990.00
	3	$5.00	$110.00
	4	$25.00	$550.00
	5	$80.00	$1,760.00
Ref #53	**516E43100**	**ELASTOMERIC BEARING WITH INTERNAL LAMINATES ONLY (, (44 EACH)**	
	Awd	$125.00	$5,500.00
	2	$110.00	$4,840.00
	3	$135.00	$5,940.00
	4	$152.00	$6,688.00
	5	$170.00	$7,480.00
Ref #54	**517E75121**	**RAILING (CONCRETE PARAPET WITH TWIN STEEL TUBE RAI, (191 FT)**	
	Awd	$375.00	$71,625.00
	2	$310.00	$59,210.00
	3	$335.00	$63,985.00
	4	$295.00	$56,345.00
	5	$425.00	$81,175.00
Ref #55	**518E21200**	**POROUS BACKFILL WITH GEOTEXTILE FABRIC, (28 CY)**	
	Awd	$120.00	$3,360.00
	2	$130.00	$3,640.00
	3	$185.00	$5,180.00
	4	$100.00	$2,800.00
	5	$75.00	$2,100.00
Ref #56	**518E40000**	**6" PERFORATED CORRUGATED PLASTIC PIPE, (92 FT)**	
	Awd	$16.00	$1,472.00
	2	$20.00	$1,840.00
	3	$55.00	$5,060.00
	4	$20.00	$1,840.00
	5	$25.00	$2,300.00
Ref #57	**518E40010**	**6" NON-PERFORATED CORRUGATED PLASTIC PIPE, INCLUDI, (18 FT)**	
	Awd	$18.00	$324.00
	2	$20.00	$360.00
	3	$55.00	$990.00
	4	$20.00	$360.00
	5	$50.00	$900.00

Ref #58	**524E94604**	**DRILLED SHAFTS, 30" DIAMETER, INTO BEDROCK, (76 FT)**	
	Awd	$700.00	$53,200.00
	2	$736.00	$55,936.00
	3	$550.00	$41,800.00
	4	$1,000.00	$76,000.00
	5	$860.00	$65,360.00
Ref #59	**526E10001**	**REINFORCED CONCRETE APPROACH SLABS (T=12"), AS PER, (147 SY)**	
	Awd	$300.00	$44,100.00
	2	$320.00	$47,040.00
	3	$375.00	$55,125.00
	4	$250.00	$36,750.00
	5	$355.00	$52,185.00
Ref #60	**526E90011**	**TYPE A INSTALLATION, AS PER PLAN, (92 FT)**	
	Awd	$180.00	$16,560.00
	2	$130.00	$11,960.00
	3	$130.00	$11,960.00
	4	$100.00	$9,200.00
	5	$160.00	$14,720.00
Ref #61	**530E13000**	**SPECIAL - FORM LINER, (381 SF)**	
	Awd	$14.00	$5,334.00
	2	$60.00	$22,860.00
	3	$45.00	$17,145.00
	4	$23.10	$8,801.10
	5	$35.00	$13,335.00
Ref #62	**601E32204**	**ROCK CHANNEL PROTECTION, TYPE C WITH GEOTEXTILE FA, (54 CY)**	
	Awd	$115.00	$6,210.00
	2	$155.00	$8,370.00
	3	$155.00	$8,370.00
	4	$100.00	$5,400.00
	5	$210.00	$11,340.00
Ref #63	**613E41200**	**LOW STRENGTH MORTAR BACKFILL, (24 CY)**	
	Awd	$180.00	$4,320.00
	2	$340.00	$8,160.00
	3	$625.00	$15,000.00
	4	$130.00	$3,120.00
	5	$150.00	$3,600.00
Ref #64	**625E33000**	**STRUCTURE GROUNDING SYSTEM, (1 EACH)**	
	Awd	$7,500.00	$7,500.00
	2	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	3	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
	4	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	5	$7,500.00	$7,500.00
Ref #65	**846E00110**	**POLYMER MODIFIED ASPHALT EXPANSION JOINT SYSTEM, (25 CF)**	
	Awd	$665.00	$16,625.00
	2	$625.00	$15,625.00
	3	$700.00	$17,500.00
	4	$650.00	$16,250.00
	5	$595.00	$14,875.00

Section 8 - STRUCTURE OVER 20 FOOT SPAN (4734115) - Totals

Awd	**$739,956.10**
2	**$801,152.60**
3	**$856,717.00**
4	**$834,691.80**
5	**$862,534.75**

Ref #66	**103E05000**	**PREMIUM FOR CONTRACT PERFORMANCE BOND AND FOR PAYM, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	2	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	3	$14,500.00	$14,500.00
	4	$12,000.00	$12,000.00
	5	$25,000.00	$25,000.00
Ref #67	**108E30000**	**CPM PROGRESS SCHEDULE SHORT DURATION PROJECTS, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$2,000.00	$2,000.00
	2	$6,500.00	$6,500.00
	3	$3,000.00	$3,000.00
	4	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
	5	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
Ref #68	**614E11000**	**MAINTAINING TRAFFIC, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$7,000.00	$7,000.00
	2	$2,000.00	$2,000.00
	3	$6,000.00	$6,000.00
	4	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	5	$30,000.00	$30,000.00
Ref #69	**623E10000**	**CONSTRUCTION LAYOUT STAKES AND SURVEYING, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	2	$10,000.00	$10,000.00
	3	$12,000.00	$12,000.00
	4	$6,500.00	$6,500.00
	5	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
Ref #70	**624E10000**	**MOBILIZATION, (LUMP SUM)**	
	Awd	$30,000.00	$30,000.00
	2	$20,000.00	$20,000.00
	3	$20,000.00	$20,000.00
	4	$40,000.00	$40,000.00
	5	$40,000.00	$40,000.00

Section 9 - INCIDENTALS - Totals

Awd	**$59,000.00**
2	**$48,500.00**
3	**$55,500.00**
4	**$73,500.00**
5	**$105,000.00**